

**Review of Πάνος Βλαγκόπουλος, «Βλέπεις, ξένε φίλε μου ότι δεν λησμονώ τα τραγούδια»: Από τον Haxthausen στον Vinée ή εκατό χρόνια δυτικοευρωπαϊκού βλέμματος στο ελληνικό δημοτικό τραγούδι (Αθήνα: Edition Orpheus/Ωδείο Αθηνών, 2022) (Panos Vlagopoulos, "As You Can See, My Friend, I Do not Forget the Songs": From Haxthausen to Vinée or a Hundred Years of Western-European Gaze on Greek Folk Song [Athens: Edition Orpheus/Athens Conservatory, 2022])**

**Panagiotis C. Poulos**

National and Kapodistrian University of Athens  
ppoulos@music.uoa.gr

The book «Βλέπεις, ξένε φίλε μου ότι δεν λησμονώ τα τραγούδια»: Από τον Haxthausen στον Vinée ή εκατό χρόνια δυτικοευρωπαϊκού βλέμματος στο ελληνικό δημοτικό τραγούδι by Panos Vlagopoulos comes at a time when research interest in the relationship between Greece and Europe is locally revived due to the recent bicentennial of the Greek Revolution. This revived interest resonates further with current issues and debates in the fields of humanities and social sciences in general. At the centre of this revival lies a demand for an epistemological shift towards a decentralized view of the long 19th century and of the political social and cultural processes that took place on a global level: the need for a perspective freed from the Eurocentric burdens of the past. Along this line of thinking is also the need for a critical stance towards the hegemonic approach of Europe to the "East" and to other parts of the colonized world. This approach has foregrounded local narratives and viewpoints on the core notions at stake in the 19th century such as modernization, development, racial origins and supremacy, nation, etc. Among the fruits of this approach is the profound understanding of the history of European ideas, culture, and music.

The first point to be made regarding the book's contribution to the study of Greek music, and musicology in general, concerns the approach to "Herderism." The book foregrounds the internal diversity and contradictions of Herderism, which is often repeated as an undifferentiated and concrete theoretical scheme in order to describe the activity and work of European researchers of folk-music culture of the Near East and Greece. Vlagopoulos deftly shows the diversity and contradictions in the reception of the Herderian tradition. As he aptly observes: "If there is anything academically reprehensible here, it is not a case of pure 'mistake,' but the lack of differentiation in the tracing of influences and the flattening approach towards starting points and trajectories" (2022, 102). And he goes on to suggest that: "...the

search for the history of Herder's reception should be accompanied by openness to all the components that shape the phenomenon under study" (2022, 107). This openness is dominant throughout the book.

The genealogy of five song-collection editors, namely Werner von Haxthausen (1780–1843), Leopold Schefer (1784–1865), Bourgault-Ducoudray (1840–1910), Aramis (=Περικλῆς Αραβαντινός), and Anselme Vinée (1847–1921), obviously constitutes an entity, which, nonetheless, includes internal differentiations, objections, and contested points. The most obvious tension is that between the German and French approach towards folk culture and the subsequent traditions of orientalism (after Said [1978]). Johann Gottfried Herder's (1744–1803) meticulous program for the collection of "folk song" with the relevant ideological baggage and ideas about the analogy between music and language is identified with the first tradition. In the second one, there belongs the Napoleon colonial project and its intellectual heyday that is the monumental work *Description de l'Égypte*. This work, besides its contribution to humanities, such as, for example, the development of Egyptology and the input to the visual representation of the "East" in the 19th and 20th centuries, contributed to the recycling of its stereotypical imagery in Europe (Mitchell 1991, 31). In this context, the work by the French musicologist Guillaume André Villoteau (1739–1859), although it is centred on Egypt, sets a strong methodological example for the musicological encounter between Europe and the "East." Among one of its core features is the physical presence of the researcher in the field, which is also evident in the book of Bourgault-Ducoudray. A symbolic instance of the internal tension that Vlagopoulos describes is the participation of Haxthausen himself in the war against Napoleon (2022, 30).

A common methodological axis between the German and the French traditions is the adoption of systematic and detailed description and transcription, broadly defined, during the colonization and manipulation of the research object: in this case, the Greek folk songs. In this process of transcription, Vlagopoulos identifies four distinct forms of symbolic violence. The first form concerns the act of collecting folk songs primarily among the Greeks of diaspora. The second form of violence is the editing process on behalf of the collectors. The third form pertains to the harmonization of folk songs and finally the fourth form "is that by composers who select their primary material from folk-music sources to be used in a composition" (2022, 26).

Based on the above remarks, Vlagopoulos vitally contributes to our understanding of the "pre-history" of European ethnomusicology and particularly of the ethnomusicology of Greek music. In addition, the featured collections contain significant unknown material that is inviting to the analytically studies and explorations by specialists. This material is offered for comparative analysis to other written or oral sources, parallel transcription methods, modes of presentation, etc. The most important contribution of the book, which resonated with the current ethnomusicological understanding, is the systematic attempt by Vlagopoulos to place these collective ventures within a complex human network, whose nodes constitute meeting points of the European and Greek intelligentsia with the worlds of informants located in Greek diaspora, in Greece (Athens, in the case of Aramis), and in the urban centres of the Ottoman Empire, Izmir and Istanbul. Apart from the analysis of this network, regarding its ideological and cultural characteristics, and the social stratification of its agents, the author succeeds in foregrounding the field of "in-between orality," where music, in the form of songs, is performed and transmitted through multiple and diverse modes and

inscriptions/transcriptions, that is, from sound to memory, from memory to paper (notation), and back to sound. Or even, from the countryside the urban centres. Certain informants stand out as "cultural brokers" (after Driessen [2013]), who mediate between different musical practices and perceptions, and participate in "cultural transfers" and "cultural translations."

The approach of this collective process as a network contributes to a decentralized view of the long 19th century. The music mediations that emerge through this view are not unidirectional and the power relationships that develop among the members of the network are not always asymmetrical. This is demonstrated by the concept of the "mutual benefits argument" that Vlagopoulos uses in relation to the impact of the music transcriptions and the harmonization of the collected songs. At this point, it is worth looking closely at the eastern part of the network and referring to the situation of music in the Ottoman Empire and the relationships that emerged with the European collectors and their work. At the time of Bourgault-Ducoudray's visit to Izmir and Istanbul, Ottoman-music modernization process was already ongoing, having started already at the beginning of the 19th century. In the light of recent research on the history of Ottoman music, the activity at the court, led by Giuseppe Donizzeti, was not unconnected to the attempts towards music reform, carried through by circles of the Greek-Orthodox and the Armenian churches (Olley 2017). Bourgault-Ducoudray met with central figures active in the late-Ottoman-music modernization process. For instance, in Izmir, he met with Misail Misailidi and, in Istanbul, with the circle of the *Philologikos Syllogos*. These were mutual musical mediations, whose content and significance are subjected to future research.

During that time, there was a growing interest in Greek and Turkish folk song that had started playing an important role in the gradual formation of a scholarly approach to folk-music culture in general (Chaldæaki 2022). The emergence and expansion of music printing and the pioneer publications of Greek-Orthodox ecclesiastical and Ottoman urban music, which aimed at promoting the newly reformed music system known as "New Method," played a vital role in this development (see Kallimopoulou in this volume). These printed publications were followed by others, containing harmonized secular repertoire. The gradual inclusion of folk songs from the Asia Minor of both Greek- and Turkish-speaking Christian populations developed in parallel to these publishing traditions.

Giderim, giderim, yolum tükenmez  
Ardına bakarım, sevdâyım gelmez

[Γκιδέρουμ, γκιδέρουμ ολούμ του καινμες αμάν! αμάν!  
Αρδουνα πακάρουμ σευδαϊμ γελιμες]<sup>1</sup>

No matter for how long I go, the road is endless  
I look back, no sign of my love following me.

This is a couplet of one of the songs that Werner von Haxthausen included in his collection. This Turkish folk song appeared in harmonized form (125). This example brings in a final point about the book, which is the "second live" [=δεύτερη ζωή] of the Greek folk songs that Vlagopoulos also stresses (39). In addition to the ethnomusicological relevance that has been so far discussed, there is also the pure musical significance that stems from the musical texts themselves, their subtle differentiations and gestures in the way they are harmonized and are

---

1 The Turkish verse is written in the Greek alphabet, alluding to the Karamanlidika from.

masterfully analyzed by Vlagopoulos. The future performances of those pieces will reveal the aural culture of the European collectors and will echo the complex human network of which they had been members.

## Works Cited

- Chaldæaki, Evangelia, 2022. *Η δημοτική μουσική στις τουρκόφωνες και ελληνόφωνες μουσικές συλλογές της ύστερης οθωμανικής περιόδου: λαϊκός πολιτισμός και διακοινοτικές σχέσεις*, PhD Diss. Athens: National and Kapodistrian University of Athens
- Driessen, Henk, 2013. "Mediterranean Divides and Connections: The Role of Dragomans as Cultural Brokers," in *Agents of Transculturation: Border-crossers, Mediators, Go-betweens*, ed. Sebastian Jobs and Gesa Mackenthun, 25-38. Münster, New York, München, Berlin: Waxmann.
- Mitchell, Timothy. 1991. *Colonising Egypt: With a New Preface*. Berkeley, Los Angeles & London: University of California Press.
- Olley, Jacob, 2017. *Writing music in nineteenth-century Istanbul. Ottoman Armenians and the invention of the Hampartzum notation*, PhD Diss. London: King's College London
- Said, Edward. 1978. *Orientalism*. London: Pantheon Books.

## About the Author

Panagiotis C. Poulos (BA, PhD SOAS, University of London) is Assistant Professor of Ethnomusicology at the Department of Music Studies of the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens. His research centres on the musical traditions of the Middle East, the cultural history of late Ottoman and Turkish music and arts, and the history of everyday life in Ottoman cities. He is author of *Music in the Islamic World: Sources, Perspectives, Practices* (2015, e-book), and co-editor of *Ottoman Intimacies, Balkan Musical Realities* (2013, with A. Theodosiou & R. P. Pennanen) and of *Ottoman Monuments in Greece: Heritages under Negotiation* (2023, with E. Kolovos and G. Pallis). Panagiotis C. Poulos is the principal investigator of the research project *Intercommunal musical geographies of late Ottoman Istanbul* (Hellenic Foundation of Research and Innovation, 2019-2022) and scientific director (with E. Kolovos) of the research project *Histories, Spaces and Heritages at the transition from the Ottoman Empire to the Greek state* (École française d'Athènes, 2017-2021).